



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

ciples, suited to give him great reputation, for such a collection of songs from the mouths of the people does not exist in print; yet a mere translation of Arab poetry is not adapted to convey the thought or music of the oriental to the occidental. Though the table of contents seems promising, the *Diwan* is not at all adapted to be an independent work on "manners and customs," nor can it be considered a substitute for one. Indeed, it should rather be a second volume as a supplement to a thorough discussion of the manners and customs of the people by the author. It cannot be understood without previous knowledge of the people, or without a mastery of the literature of the subject. As an academic performance it is worthy of all praise, but not as the best that the author should contribute in this department. It is doubtless true that Dalman in his new position as the head of the German archæological school in Jerusalem may be expected to make important contributions to the literature of the subject.

GEORGE S. GOODSPEED.

IRA MAURICE PRICE.

HERBERT L. WILLETT.

JOHN M. P. SMITH.

#### RECENT LITERATURE IN CHURCH HISTORY.

THE books to be noticed in this collective review treat a great variety of subjects. In the list there are some works of superior merit, and nearly all were well worth the making. Large books designed for popular use may be scholarly in character, and small books on themes of remote interest may represent the most painstaking and laborious research. To both kinds the attention of the reader will be called in this article. The literature lays emphasis on no special division or branch of church history, unless Methodism is an exception. The evangelical revival of the eighteenth century and the progress of the Wesleyan movement have more prominence than any other single topic. The occasion of this is, of course, the bi-centenary of Wesley's birth.

#### ARCHÆOLOGICAL.

In Archæology the *Dictionnaire*<sup>1</sup> just issued from the French press is worthy of mention. There is a large place waiting for a good ency-

<sup>1</sup>*Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie*. Publié par LE R. P. DOM FERNAND CABROL, Bénédictin de Solesmes, Prieur de Farnborough (Angleterre), avec le concours d'un grand nombre de collaborateurs. Fascicule I. Paris: Letouzey & Ané, 1903. 287 pages. Fr. 5.

clopedia of Christian antiquities in which Roman Catholic views shall be represented. If the Roman Catholic is often too credulous, the Protestant is sometimes too skeptical, and needs to be corrected from the representatives of tradition. Judging by the initial "fascicule" now before me, this *Dictionnaire* will prove a valuable contribution to the subject from the Roman Catholic point of view. It is learned and critical and full. The contributors to it number forty. Perhaps a disproportionate space is allotted to liturgical questions, but these will interest Roman Catholics and high Anglicans, though the Protestant world at large will care little for them. Among the most notable articles in this "fascicule" is the one on "Abercius," occupying eleven pages, and giving a complete apparatus for the study of the famous inscription; the one on "Abgar," occupying five pages, in which the legendary character of the story is maintained; and the one on "Accusations contre les Chrétiens," occupying twelve pages, and to be completed in the next number perhaps with as many more. The illustrations are numerous, and some of them are excellent. It is to be regretted that others are coarse and cheap. The bibliographies are ample, and show a good acquaintance with the most recent literature, whether Roman Catholic or Protestant. If this *Dictionnaire* does not entirely supersede Kraus and Smith and Cheetham, it will at least add much to them, and in many places will bring us the fruits of more careful research.

The trustees of the British Museum\* have rendered a valuable service to those students of Christian archæology who cannot visit their collections. Their little book is full of interest and instruction. The first half of it is devoted to an introduction, in which the chief features of Christian archæology are set forth with admirable brevity and completeness. The second half contains descriptions of the objects associated with early Christianity which are preserved in the museum. There are more than a hundred illustrations, the majority of them photographs, and all of them remarkable for distinctness of definition.

The skeleton of Lazarus,<sup>3</sup> the friend of Christ, has been shown both at Autun, France, and at Andlau, Alsace. Rev. Joseph Rietsch enters

\**British Museum: A Guide to the Early Christian and Byzantine Antiquities.* With fifteen Plates and eighty-four Illustrations. Printed by order of the Trustees. xii + 116 pages. 1s.

<sup>3</sup>*Die nachevangelischen Geschiehe der bethanischen Geschwister und die Lazarus-reliquien zu Andlau.* Von JOS. RIETSCH, Vikar an St. Stephan in Mülhausen i. E. Strassburg: Le Roux, 1902. 59 pages. M. 0.90.

the lists against the French relics, and in favor of the German. It is easier for him to break down the defenses of the former than to erect good defenses for the latter. He succeeds however, in discovering an early oriental tradition that Lazarus became bishop of Citium in Cyprus. He renders it probable that the genuine relics of Lazarus were carried to Constantinople. He shows further that Mary, the sister of Lazarus, is not identified with Mary Magdalene in eastern tradition as she is in western. For the historian the chief interest of the pamphlet will consist in the possibility which it offers of tracing the career of Lazarus after his return from the grave. The materials brought together by Rietsch for this purpose are worthy of respect, and constitute a real contribution to our knowledge of the subject.

#### GENERAL CHURCH HISTORY.

In general church history no new works of importance have appeared. The small volume by Horsch<sup>4</sup> sketches the origin and growth of Christianity to the present time. The author is ruled by the idea that the true history of the church is found in the life and practice of believers rather than in the papal hierarchy and state establishments. All improvements on the great work of Dr. Moeller<sup>5</sup> will be welcomed by students of church history. Dr. Schubert's corrections are considerable, and appear everywhere to have been admirably done. The preceding parts of the beautiful work by Baum and Geyer<sup>6</sup> have already been noticed in this JOURNAL. This last part is fully equal in excellence to the preceding parts, and the book as a whole is much to be desired. It contains a good index.

The recent works on special phases of general church history are of only ordinary interest. Among them we may notice that of Mrs. Bell<sup>7</sup> who starts out with the purpose of "sifting the true from the legendary," and giving us the results of recent studies in the lives of the

<sup>4</sup>*A Short History of Christianity.* By JOHN HORSCH. Cleveland, O.: Published by the Author. 312 pages. \$1, net.

<sup>5</sup>*Lehrbuch der Kirchengeschichte.* Von DR. WILHELM MOELLER. Erster Band, "Die alte Kirche," zweite und dritte Abteilungen. Zweite Auflage neubearbeitet von DR. HANS VON SCHUBERT. Tübingen und Leipzig: Mohr, 1902. 69 pages. M. 4.

<sup>6</sup>*Kirchengeschichte für das evangelische Haus.* Von FRIEDERICH BAUM UND DR. CHRISTIAN GEYER. Dritte Auflage, fünfte (Schluss-) Lieferung. München: Beck, 1902. M. 2.20.

<sup>7</sup>*Lives and Legends of the Evangelists, Apostles, and Other Early Saints.* By MRS. ARTHUR BELL. London: Bell; New York: Macmillan, 1901. x+284 pages. \$4.50, net.

saints. This carries her into various fields of criticism. Fortunately, she does not devote much of her space to them, for she is not at home in them. We may glance at a few of her critical opinions:

A very typical example of what the new criticism has achieved is the solution of the mystery of the non-intervention of heaven in cases where a saint was condemned to be beheaded. Why, after some steadfast believer has been rescued from fire and water, and preserved unharmed through protracted tortures of the most horrible description, no effort should have been made to arrest the sword when it was raised to destroy him, has long puzzled the student of Christian legend.

The explanation, as determined by "the new criticism," is that the makers of the legends recognized the legal right of the officer to kill with the sword or the ax, the emblems of the civil power, but not by any other means, since other instruments were not emblems of the civil power. We are equally disposed to believe when she assures us, as sober history, that the emissaries of Herod pursued Zacharias, the father of John the Baptist, "into the very holy of holies, and there put him to death." On quite as good authority she affirms that "there is every reason to believe that St. Joseph was a master builder, his work often taking him away from home;" that there is no proof that Matthew wrote the gospel attributed to him; and that only a portion of the Acts is from Luke. But when we turn from these adventures in the fields of criticism, we find much for which to be grateful. Mrs. Bell is thoroughly acquainted with the painting of the Roman Catholic church. Her knowledge of it is not limited to a few of the great painters and a few of their greatest paintings. It extends to the more obscure artists, almost every one of whom has left us something worthy of admiration. Her appreciation is genuine and personal, and not gathered from books. She is familiar with the entire range of Christian symbolism. She has unstudied skill in communicating her thought. On the whole, her work is worthy to stand beside those of Mrs. Jameson and Mrs. Clement. It has the advantage of an acquaintance with the most recent literature on the subject. The publisher has done much for the book, giving it photographic illustrations of a high order, and luxurious paper and binding.

The small volume by Thümmel<sup>8</sup> is a part of the more comprehensive study of excommunication. The Romish church inflicts punishments upon the living and the dead. But the Evangelical church

<sup>8</sup>*Die Versagung der kirchlichen Bestattungsfeier, ihre geschichtliche Entwicklung und gegenwärtige Bedeutung.* Von W. THÜMMEL. Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1902. viii + 196 pages. M. 2.80.

recognizes no church punishments—they are unworthy of a church. The work is divided into two parts. The first is historical, beginning with the denial or lessening of the ceremony among the Greeks, Romans, and Hebrews; the Christians during the first five centuries; the ecclesiastics from the sixth to the seventeenth century. Then follow sections on the Reformation; orthodoxy, and the illumination; and the nineteenth century. The second part treats of the present import of the ceremony in its various phases. The work is one of much value to those seeking a knowledge of the subject in a small compass.

The history of baptism,<sup>9</sup> so far as it has yet been written, considers only two classes of subjects, namely, adults and infants. But in the lapse from the baptism of believers to infant baptism there was an intermediate stage of child baptism, distinct from both the others. In the first century the typical candidate was an adult; in the tenth century the typical candidate was an infant; but in the fifth or sixth century the typical candidate was a young child, not an infant. This middle stage of the process has yet to be studied by historians. Diettrich presents us with a contribution to the subject, though he does not recognize it as such. He calls it "the oldest ritual of infant baptism known in Christendom." But it is plainly not adapted to infants, but to young children who have emerged from infancy. Diettrich is cast into great perplexity by his lack of acquaintance with this intermediate stage of the process. No less than four times does he find himself compelled to add footnotes to the text pointing out features which are inapplicable to infants, and referring them to adults. But obviously they have neither adults nor infants in view; they regard the candidate as a young child. In addition to these four, we have marked five passages of the same class. A liturgy for infant baptism containing nine passages which cannot possibly be applied to the baptism of infants would be a strange thing. In this liturgy we have passed down below the stage of the child instructed in the catechumen school. The candidate is younger, for the catechumen schools have fallen into decay or extinction. Hence the ceremonies of exorcism, of the renunciation of the devil, and of the confession of faith are omitted, and, at certain places, the child is held in the arms of an older person as a symbolical act. We see the Nestorian church approaching infant baptism, but not yet fully adopting it. With the exception of this

<sup>9</sup>*Die nestorianische Taufliturgie ins Deutsche übersetzt und unter Verwertung der neuesten handschriftlichen Funde historisch-kritisch erforscht.* Von LIC. DR. G. DIETRICH. Giessen: Ricker, 1903. xxxi + 103 pages. M. 4.

misinterpretation, the work of Diettrich is admirably done, and fills a place in the history of baptism which was almost empty.

Dr. Barry traces the history of the papacy<sup>10</sup> from the first bishop of Rome to the overthrow of Boniface VIII. at the opening of the fourteenth century. He writes sympathetically, being a Roman priest, but is chiefly concerned with the facts, and so is at liberty to point out without reserve the strong and weak points on all sides. The result is a very admirable and judicial survey of the papal monarchy from its beginning to its overthrow as a temporal world-power. The style is always limpid and often felicitous. His grasp of the entire situation is comprehensive. The reader may therefore count on a pleasant and instructive journey with him over thirteen centuries of history. There are numerous illustrations which add much to the interest and value of the book. Among these are Anagni and the papal palace and broken bridge of Avignon. Dr. Barry is very sure that the mediæval papacy served a great and necessary purpose as the

guardian at once of faith, learning, law, and civilization. . . . Its benefits far outnumber its abuses, and the glory is not dim which hangs round its memory when we call to mind that it consecrated the beginnings of a peaceful, Christian Europe and watched beside the springs of art, science, industry, order and freedom. (P. 428.)

Along with many other large movements and long-standing institutions it came to an end in the second half of the thirteenth century.

#### THE REFORMATION PERIOD.

Mr. Workman's<sup>11</sup> books constitute a series of improvements. This last volume is the best of them all. It is based entirely on original investigation. Each paragraph is the author's independent judgment. He was running perilously close to Bishop Creighton, but in each case he reached his own conclusions before consulting the bishop. So the entire volume bears the impress of originality. Hus is tardily coming to a just recognition. While Wiclif was undoubtedly his master, Hus has a value and importance of his own. He had his own forerunners, and grew up in the atmosphere of his own nationality and his own times. It is safe to assume that if he had never heard of Wiclif, he would nevertheless have made a great stir. This is clearly seen from the true historical setting which Mr. Workman has given him. We

<sup>10</sup> *The Papal Monarchy*. By WILLIAM BARRY, D.D. New York: Putnam, 1902. xxii + 435 pages. \$1.50.

<sup>11</sup> *The Dawn of the Reformation*. By HERBERT B. WORKMAN. Vol. II: "The Age of Hus." London: Kelley, 1902. xvi + 374 pages. 3s. 6d.

have one hundred and fourteen pages dealing with the Great Schism, the Council of Pisa, and the forerunners of Hus, before the central figure is introduced. The bibliographies are very full, giving both original and secondary sources. Eighteen brief but valuable appendices enhance the value of the work. The volume is bright and attractive, and is an advance upon its predecessors. We hope that the author will give us another volume on the influence of the Mystics, as he half promises in his preface.

Some brief periods of time are so full of momentous influences that we never cease to study them in the hope of understanding them better. Such a period is that of the Leipsic disputation between Eck on the one side, and Carlstadt and Luther on the other. Seitz<sup>12</sup> has found three new manuscript sources from which to construct the history. They contribute something to our knowledge of it, though not much. They give us a more correct Latin text of the speeches. They give us more exact dates at certain points. They give us some names of attendants not before published. This work of Seitz will take its place as the standard for all future references to the debate and all future quotations from the utterances of the champions on either side.

The value of a work on the evangelical church codes of the sixteenth century<sup>13</sup> depends on its completeness and its accuracy. The volume leaves nothing to be desired in either of these respects. Its completeness is seen in the fact that the legislation is sometimes repeated for the different districts to which it was applied by Luther, though an effort has been made to avoid a too tedious reiteration of the same things. Its painstaking accuracy is equally apparent. Each code is accompanied by a historical introduction admirable for fulness and perspicuity. The old spelling has been modified, though not entirely modernized, so that one can read these earliest laws of the Lutheran church with ease. Latin types have been substituted for the German throughout. The paper is luxurious, and the press-work a model of distinctness and beauty. This first volume is more important for the general reader than any of the others, for it shows us Luther

<sup>12</sup>*Der authentische Text der Leipziger Disputation (1519): Aus bisher unbenutzten Quellen.* Herausgegeben von LIC. THEOL. OTTO SEITZ. Berlin: Schwetschke & Sohn, 1903. iv + 247 pages. M. 3.

<sup>13</sup>*Die evangelischen Kirchenordnungen des XVI. Jahrhunderts.* Herausgegeben von DR. JUR. EMIL SEHLING, Universitäts-Professor in Erlangen. Erste Abtheilung: "Sachsen und Thüringen, nebst angrenzenden Gebieten;" Erste Hälfte: "Die Ordnungen Luthers; Die ernestinischen und albertinischen Gebiete." Leipzig: Reissland, 1902. xxiii + 746 pages. M. 36.



driven to the disagreeable task of legislating for a vast church left without precise regulations, and accomplishing it with rare tact and wisdom. Had he possessed as much skill in selecting men to carry out these regulations as in framing them, he would have been known as one of the great organizers and rulers of history. As curious and interesting as any other features of this legislation are the scraps of theology which he intersperses through it. The work is a monument of careful editing and clear exposition.

*The Reformation in Goslar*<sup>14</sup> is the seventh number in a series entitled "Quellen und Darstellungen zur Geschichte Niedersachsens." Goslar came over to the Protestants in 1528 after the heroic age of the Reformation, and hence the narrative presents relatively few dramatic incidents and characters. For readers in general its interest may be somewhat diminished by the exact reproduction of many documents of the sixteenth century with their orthography unchanged. This feature, however, renders it valuable to the investigator, for whom it was prepared, and to whom it is strongly recommended.

*Johann von Leiden*<sup>15</sup> is the first number of a series entitled "Bilder aus der religiösen und sozialen Unruhen in Münster während des 16. Jahrhunderts." The author writes with full command of the sources and with considerable literary skill, and constructs a historic picture at once accurate and fascinating. He begins by exonerating the anabaptists as a body from all sympathy with the polygamy of John of Leyden, and protests against the inference that their views contained any tendency to vice. He has something new to tell us about the chief actor in the tragedy of Münster, and presents him to us as a sort of Miltonic Satan. John of Leyden is usually regarded as an ignorant fanatic, and nothing more. But here he rises to the proportions of a bad hero, sensual, self-seeking, but of consummate ability. We see him defending Münster for a year and four months against the repeated assaults of overwhelming numbers brought from all parts of the empire. This he does with a force that could never have exceeded sixteen hundred men. He is overcome at last only by treachery. If the other volumes of the series shall prove as fair and as

<sup>14</sup> *Die Geschichte der Reformation in Goslar; nach dem Berichte der Akten im städtischen Archive dargestellt.* Von PROFESSOR DR. HÖLSCHER. Hannover und Leipzig: Hahn, 1902. 195 pages. M. 3.60.

<sup>15</sup> *Johann von Leiden. Seine Persönlichkeit und seine Stellung im münsterschen Reiche.* Von DR. HEINRICH DETMER. Münster (Westf.): Coppenrath, 1903. 71 pages. M. 1.25.

interesting as this, it will give us valuable guidance through one of the small but curious by-paths of church history.

Pietism<sup>16</sup> has played an important part in the history of the Lutheran church. We have before us a brief treatise which reviews the whole subject, taking in the movement of Spener from about 1680 to 1703, and the contest with separatistic Pietism from 1703 to 1705, and the growth of tolerance from 1715 on. It could hardly have been possible that Pietism would not result in separatism, for the same causes operating according to the same laws are found here as in all cases where divisions take place. The author finds that the difference between orthodoxy and Pietism is not so much dogmatic and ethical as practical and ecclesiastical. The service of Pietism was to push back the over estimation of pure doctrine by toning up the religious life through a return to the Scriptures as a source; to put new emphasis on personal Christian life as over against faith in ecclesiastical institutions; to give proper recognition to the lay element; in short Pietism may be briefly defined as the emancipation of personal piety from the power of the church.

Dr. Kolde writes an important chapter in the history of toleration.<sup>17</sup> Notwithstanding the terrible instruction of the Thirty Years' War, Bavaria refused to permit Protestant citizenship and Protestant worship until the opening of the nineteenth century. In order to maintain her position as the champion of Catholicism in Germany, she banished her best people and sacrificed her industries and reduced herself to poverty. Two influences induced her to adopt a saner policy, neither of them of a very lofty nature. One was her perception of her industrial and intellectual decadence; the other, the spread of rationalism among her rulers, making them indifferent to all the religious confessions. The change came in 1803. It led to the immigration of Protestants, to the revival of business, and to renewed intellectual vigor. The state is still Catholic; the Protestants in it are not numerous; but it has joined in the general advance of the German empire, though it does not occupy the leading position which its great population and its abundant natural resources should give it.

<sup>16</sup> *Die Anfänge des Pietismus und Separatismus in Württemberg.* Von CHR. KOLB. Stuttgart: Kohlhammer. iii + 218 pages. M. 2.

<sup>17</sup> *Das bayerische Religionsedikt vom 10. Januar, 1803, und die Anfänge der protestantischen Landeskirche in Bayern.* Ein Gedenkblatt. Von DR. THEODOR KOLDE. Erlangen: Junge, 1903. 44 pages. M. 0.90.

## ENGLISH CHURCH HISTORY.

In an earlier number of this JOURNAL we have already expressed our high appreciation of *A History of the English Church*, edited by Stephens and Hunt, and to be completed in seven volumes. Four of the volumes, bringing the history down to the death of Mary, are now before the public, and they amply fulfil the promise of the editors to base their work on "a careful study of original authorities and the best ancient and modern writers," and to make it their principal concern to tell the truth without partisan prepossession and bias. Editor Hunt prepared the first volume,<sup>18</sup> extending from Gregory to William the Conqueror. Of it we have already said that if the volumes which follow equal it in learning and candor, the work as a whole will be the best history of the English church yet written. The second volume<sup>19</sup> in the series, prepared by Editor Stephens, extending from William to Edward I., is equally worthy of commendation. It deals with such kings as the Conqueror, William Rufus, and Henry I. and II., and with such great ecclesiastics as Lanfranc, Anselm, Becket, and Langton. The third volume<sup>20</sup> in the series, dealing with the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, was intrusted to Canon Capes. He has abundant knowledge directly from the documents, has this knowledge under complete control, is fair-minded and sympathetic, and is so nearly unerring in his conclusions that one hesitates long before differing from him on any important matter. His period is one of stirring events, including such subjects as Chaucer, Wiclif, Langland, the Great Plague, the uprising of the peasants, the Lollards. We are naturally much interested in the state of education in this period, and so we have a most interesting chapter on schools and universities. Nearly all the phases of church life receive careful attention, and with the fullest knowledge of these various subjects, Canon Capes has given us a very complete picture of these two centuries with all the parts organically related. A very good test of a churchman's fairness in treating this period is to be seen in his manner of dealing with Wiclif and the Lollards. Our author here is eminently judicial. He evi-

<sup>18</sup>*The English Church from its Foundation to the Norman Conquest (597-1066)*. By REV. WILLIAM HUNT, M.A. London and New York: Macmillan. xix + 444 pages. \$2, net.

<sup>19</sup>*The English Church from the Norman Conquest to the Close of the Thirteenth Century*. By the Dean of Winchester. London and New York: Macmillan. xiii + 351 pages. \$2, net.

<sup>20</sup>*The English Church in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries*. By W. W. CAPES, M.A. London and New York: Macmillan. \$2, net.

dently seeks neither to overstate nor understate the case. The result is that he sees all the points and gives us a statement with which we believe that few historians with our present status of Wiclif knowledge will be likely to take issue. In the *History of the English Church* the last volume<sup>21</sup> to appear, the fourth in the series, is on the Reformation period. It is from the pen of James Gairdner. In point of learning no man is better qualified for the task. The man who can follow Professor Brewer and calendar the papers of the reign of Henry VIII. knows the history from the inside and knows it down to the finest points. But this piece of work makes it plain that the historian needs something more than erudition. Dr. Gairdner has gathered the facts and he has marshaled them in orderly sequence, but he has not written a history. After the meaning of these facts, their immense significance and importance, their bearing on human interests and destiny, he has not been concerned to inquire. He is dealing with the most thrilling period in English history, and he deals with it in so cold, hard, dry, unsympathetic a way as almost to anger the reader. He seems to have the intellect to chronicle events, but not the soul to understand, appreciate, and write history. In England a great movement was in progress, great intellectual and moral forces were in operation which were to shape and determine the destiny of the nation, and powerfully to affect the civilization of the modern world, and yet in reading these pages no one would suspect what was really going on, so blind is the author to the meaning of it all and so little does he touch the quivering life of those eventful times. The volume has its place in the series, and men will consult it to verify or correct their information about small matters, but no one will ever read it to find out what the English people were really doing in the reigns of Henry, Edward, and Mary.

To demonstrate the effect of the doctrine of our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ on certain lives, and to mark how those lives ministered to the formation of English national character, is the object of the Bampton Lectures for 1903.<sup>22</sup> The author is manifestly a ripe historical scholar. One feels that there has been throughout careful weighing and separation of matter of fact from matter of legend and myth.

<sup>21</sup> *The English Church in the Sixteenth Century from the Accession of Henry VIII. to the Death of Mary.* By JAMES GAIRDNER, ESQ., C.B., LL.D. London and New York: Macmillan. vii + 430 pages. \$2, net.

<sup>22</sup> *The Influence of Christianity upon National Character as Illustrated by the Lives and Legends of the English Saints.* ("Bampton Lectures" of 1903.) By WILLIAM HOLDEN HUTTON, B.D. New York: Dutton & Co., 1903. 385 pages. \$4, net.

A vast literature has been searched and analyzed, and from it has been educed this book, which might fairly be called a science (in outline) of English hagiology. Mr. Hutton has, in large part, made intelligible and invested with interest what has hitherto seemed too much like a mass of monotonous miracle and fable—fair field for the man whose interest lay in bones and stones, not in men and affairs. The saints herein reviewed are all of the pre-Reformation period. For the epoch of the Reformation “not unfitly,” Mr. Hutton somehow or other thinks, “closed for us in England the canon of the saints.” And he adds:

It is not that the society in which these lives were cherished can no longer bring forth fruit in perfection: but not unwisely or unnaturally the technical expression of it, the formal recognition won in past times, has ceased to be given.

One exception is to be noted, however—King Charles, saint and martyr. This king, “who even might” forget or deny “his word,” kept faith with the church, and was dubbed saint and martyr, and officially revered as such for two centuries. That is to say, he was saint and martyr, not in virtue of the possession of common honesty, but in virtue of the fact that he was defender of the church, and therefore defender of the faith, and therefore champion of the Christ. Straightway one is constrained to ask: What, then, is a saint? The book is a splendid attempt to answer this vexed question:

The saint is one who claims to live a life—of faith—of which Christ is the Leader and the Finisher; to act in a society—the church—of which Christ is the only and immortal Head.

The faith determines and defines the saint, death in the name of the faith the martyr! Throughout the book Mr. Hutton has most admirably and searchingly applied the test “by their fruits ye shall know them.” Faith and works make the saint, not works and faith. In support of this idea, in addition to the illustrations he abundantly adduces from the lives of the saints, he cites with great aptness the intent of the author of the epistle to the Hebrews (chap. 11). It is the definition of the historian rather than the idealist.

The English ideas of catholicity and the Roman do not exactly coincide, and hence not yet can the two churches coalesce. The Roman view of the situation and terms of reunion are disclosed in a volume of essays by Father Carson.<sup>23</sup> The titles of these essays will sufficiently show that it is not intended to “reunite” in the sense in which that word is commonly understood among church reunionists: “The Evo-

<sup>23</sup> *Reunion Essays*. By REV. W. R. CARSON (Roman Catholic Priest). New York: Longmans, Green & Co.

lution of Catholicism;" "A Moderate View of Papal Infallibility;" "The Social Aspect of Confession;" "The Kenosis of Christ;" "The Kenosis of the Church;" "The Maternity of God;" "The Personal Factor in Religious Belief;" "Anglican Concessions on the Invocation of Saints;" "The Rationale of Saint Worship;" and an "Appendix on the Non-Infallible Dogmatic Force of the Bull *Apostolicæ Curæ* of Pope Leo XIII. Condemning the Validity of the Holy Orders of the Church of England." In a fine old academic way Father Carson pleads throughout that the characteristic Roman—not Catholic, but Roman—dogmas of the later councils and infallible pontiffs are really not so absolute, or unreasonable, or unscriptural after all. Whatever appeal to us the book may possess comes by way of the first essay, "The Evolution of Catholicism." Its argument is familiar:

By the law of metabolism every particle of our bodily frame disappears in cycles of seven—some say even fewer—years; but this does not prevent the persistence of the same person in unaltered reality as the subject of manifold experience. . . . It is the same with the church of Christ, its constitution and its doctrine. . . . The church of Leo XIII. is the same church as that of St. Peter in the sense in which the I of today am the same as the I of thirty years ago; but the two are not identical; there is an increasing movement and process of formation.

This appeal to the continuity of life gives a color of plausibility to the whole book. For continuity of life and effort is a divine attribute. The church, as representative of this, is divine. The Roman Catholic church does represent continuity of Christian life and effort. The authentic lives of the saints attest this. The Lutheran, and English, and Scotch churches represent continuity of Christian life and effort. Seceders from these churches represent continuity of Christian life and effort. The mistake has been that those who split off have supposed, not always, but far too often, that the evidence of the divine has forsaken those historic churches and come to reside only in them. And those churches were confident the while that they still retained possession of it. What is catholicity—not Roman Catholicism, but catholicity? The question is raised by such books as these *Reunion Essays*. The possession of the loving-service spirit is presupposed. Is it also the possession of a certain richness or abundance of expression of that spirit? Can a single institution enfold all forms of that expression? Can a single institution focus all its forms of expression? Catholicity assuredly implies a wholeness, inclusiveness, comprehensiveness of some sort, whether doctrinal or geographical. How far can a church be

eclectic and yet catholic? Father Carson settles these difficulties very easily. He rightly divines that in catholicity lies the hope of reunion. But catholicity and Roman Catholicism are synonymous terms according to him, and reunion cometh by way of acceptance, among other things, of the doctrines of papal infallibility, the invocation of saints (spoken of by the twenty-second of the thirty-nine Articles of the Church of England as "a fond thing, vainly invented, and grounded upon no warranty of Scripture, but rather repugnant to the Word of God"), and by such highly speculative doctrines as the kenosis of Christ and the kenosis of the church.

#### DENOMINATIONAL HISTORY.

The celebration of the two-hundredth anniversary of John Wesley's birth called from the English and American press numerous volumes in appreciation of Methodism and its founder. Many of these are ephemeral, but some are of permanent value. No one doubts the undying worth of *Wesley's Journal*. Herein as nowhere else one learns, not only what manner of man Wesley was, but the character of the times in which he lived. It has been said that no man can understand the real history of the English people during the seventeenth, eighteenth, and nineteenth centuries who has not read most carefully the *Journals* by Fox and Wesley, and Newman's *Apologia*. Of *Wesley's Journal* it has also been said that between the two Octobers in which its first and last entries were made, fifty-five years between, "there lies the most amazing record of human exertion ever penned or endured." The recent bi-centenary celebration moved publishers in England and America to issue editions of this immortal diary. The reader who wishes the complete work must purchase the standard four-volume edition. The Watkinson<sup>24</sup> popular edition condensed is in two volumes, printing about one-half the *Journal*. The pages are in double columns, and at the top are running titles and the month and year. This device, together with a copious index, gives a ready reference to the contents. The edition by Hughes<sup>25</sup> is in a single volume and contains about one-fourth the original material. In addition to an "Introductory Essay" by the editor, it prints the celebrated "Appreciation"

<sup>24</sup> *The Journal of John Wesley*. Popular edition condensed. Introduction by REV. W. L. WATKINSON. In two volumes. London: Kelly, 1903. xii + 463 + 485 pages. 3s. 6d. each.

<sup>25</sup> *The Heart of John Wesley's Journal*. With an Introduction by HUGH PRICE HUGHES, M. A., and an Appreciation of the *Journal* by AUGUSTINE BIRRELL, K. C., edited by PERCY LIVINGSTONE PARKER. New York, Toronto, Chicago: Revell

by Augustine Birrell, K. C. The cheapest edition<sup>26</sup> in one volume of 424 pages, is published by Kelly of London. It has used the pruning knife most in the second half of the *Journal*, thus retaining all that is most thrilling in the story of early Methodism. "A Methodist Preacher" who withholds his name gives us a life of *John Wesley, the Methodist*,<sup>27</sup> written in popular style, and following for the most part the chronological order. It will command a large sale because it brims over with eulogy, is spirited in recital, is gotten up handsomely, and contains a hundred portraits, views, and facsimiles. Withrow's *Makers of Methodism*<sup>28</sup> sketches the lives of Susanna Wesley and her sons, John and Charles, Whitefield, the Countess of Huntingdon, Fletcher, Coke, Asbury, and other English and American leaders in the great revival. The design is to illustrate the spirit of the movement by the study of a few of the noteworthy actors in it. A little book by Fitzgerald, *The Roots of Methodism*<sup>29</sup> is exactly what its title imports. It deals only with those great outstanding facts which every intelligent student of the movement ought to know, and it does this in a lucid and interesting way. Another work, entitled *Wesley and His Preachers*,<sup>30</sup> conveys a mass of valuable information of a sort no one would look for from the title. It runs through more than three hundred pages of chatty, rambling gossip about the characteristic features of the eighteenth century—traveling and travelers, singular phases of town and village life, the common people and the upper classes, prisons and prisoners, superstitious notions and beliefs in which Wesley himself largely shared. It is a book from which one can get countless useful hints and side glimpses of the social, moral, material, ecclesiastical condition of things amid which Wesley lived and wrought—the cost of living, imprisonment for debt, drinking customs, the dirty habits, evil practices, brutal temper, and mob violence of the common people, the poverty and degradation of the working classes, highway robbery, wrecking and smuggling, criminals dangling on gibbets by the roadside. These pages

<sup>26</sup> *John Wesley's Journal*. Abridged edition. London: Kelly, 1903. 433 pages. 2s.

<sup>27</sup> *John Wesley the Methodist*. By a Methodist Preacher. New York: Eaton & Mains; Cincinnati: Jennings & Pye, 1903. 319 pages. \$1.25, *net*.

<sup>28</sup> *Makers of Methodism*. By W. H. WITHROW, D.D. London: Kelly, 1903. 256 pages. 2s. 6d.

<sup>29</sup> *The Roots of Methodism*. By W. B. FITZGERALD. London: Kelly, 1903. 217 pages. 2s.

<sup>30</sup> *Wesley and His Preachers: Their Conquest of Britain*. By G. HOLDEN PIKE. London: Fisher Unwin; Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1903. 910 pages. \$1.75, *net*.



reveal a state of morals well-nigh incredible, and it was out of these lowest depths of profligacy and vice that the Wesleyan revival lifted the English people. The Methodists of Canada may well rejoice in the thirty-third Fernley Lecture, in which Dr. Sutherland<sup>31</sup> presents the salient features in the development of Wesleyanism from small beginnings into that "compact and thoroughly organized church" which now numbers nearly one-fifth the whole population of the Dominion. It is a story of surpassing interest, and it is told with a clearness and felicity and force of statement which compel the reader's attention and acquiescence. In many lands the history of Methodism has repeated itself. In its essential features it is everywhere the same. In Canada as elsewhere it is a great religious movement, having its start in the rectory of Epworth and in the Holy Club at Oxford, and in its progress always intense and aggressive, eager for conquest, and confident of victory. To Methodist readers the chapters in Dr. Sutherland's survey which deal with the relations of their Canadian church with the British conference, the development of their missions, and the unification of their denomination will be deemed of special historical significance. The non-Methodist reader will be more taken with the romance and pathos of the pioneer days and with the heroic struggle for civil and religious liberty. That, too, is a history which has repeated itself wherever the English established church has borne sway. We are familiar enough with its ecclesiastical intolerance and tyranny in our own colonies, in Virginia, in Maryland, in the Carolinas, and in the mother-country itself; but quite as disgraceful was the outrageous treatment of nonconformists in Canada, and quite as resolute and triumphant was the contest in Canada for equality before the law. If in America in the Revolutionary period the Methodists were too closely allied with the English establishment to render signal service to the cause of freedom, they are to be awarded the highest meed of praise at a later period for their valiant struggle on Canadian soil for the rights of free-born citizens to worship God in keeping with their own convictions of conscience. When the Methodists once broke free from the trammels in which their founders confined them, they were among the foremost in demanding both civil and religious emancipation from Old World tyranny. The twelfth volume of Hauck-Herzog's *Realencyclopädie* closed with an article of fifty-seven pages by Professor Loofs on "Methodism;" the thirteenth volume begins with an article of twenty-

<sup>31</sup> *Methodism in Canada: Its Work and its Story*. By ALEXANDER SUTHERLAND, D.D. London: Kelly, 1903. 350 pages. 4s. 6d.

five pages on "Methodism in America"<sup>32</sup> by an able young theologian of the German Methodist church. The article by Professor Loofs is the first accurate and impartial treatment of Methodism ever published by a German theologian. While German theologians scan the history of the continental churches with a microscope, they seem to be almost blind to the rich church life of England and America. The free religious life of America especially could serve them as a laboratory and experiment station in church formation. Methodism is to be congratulated that in Professor Nuelson, of Berea, O., it has a scholar with full American information and also with full use of German, to place its history in America before the German theological world. The article is especially rich in its bibliography.

Though the contrast between Methodism and Presbyterianism in doctrine and polity is marked enough, yet in devotion to Christ, zeal for missions, love for education, and liking for organization, the two communions are animated by the same spirit. Dr. Thompson,<sup>33</sup> secretary of the Presbyterian Home Mission Board, is especially qualified to trace the history of his denomination in this country. He is more concerned with the missionary life and work of the church than with its ecclesiastical form and dogmatic thought. Presbyterian order and Calvinistic theology have their nearer origin in John Calvin, but in their essential principles they date back to Christ himself. The history proceeds on this assumption. The same may be said of another work,<sup>34</sup> covering the same ground, prepared by three Presbyterian professors of church history, each of whom tells the story through one of the three periods into which the whole is broken. We find ourselves quite in sympathy with the noble achievements which these two volumes record, but we are persuaded the wholesome impression would not have been lessened, and the truth of history would have been better conserved, had the writers frankly acknowledged some of the shortcomings of the church whose valor and virtue they have set themselves to extol. For example, from these pages no one would suspect that the Presbyterians were ever guilty of intolerance from the days of John Calvin to the

<sup>32</sup>*Methodismus in Amerika*. Separatabdruck aus der Realencyclopädie für protestantische Theologie und Kirche. Von Professor J. L. NUESLEN, D.D.

<sup>33</sup>*The Presbyterians*. ("The Story of the Churches.") By C. L. THOMPSON, D.D. New York: Baker & Taylor, 1903. 312 pages. \$1, net.

<sup>34</sup>*A Short History of American Presbyterianism*. By Drs. A. T. MCGILL, S. M. HOPKINS, AND S. J. WILSON. Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1903. 207 pages.

present hour. The impression is conveyed that they were always staunch defenders of religious liberty, and that through untold sufferings they bequeathed to us this priceless boon. Would it not have been better openly to confess that through the greater part of their history they simply wanted liberty for themselves and had no idea of granting it to others? It is true enough that they suffered at the hands of persecutors, but it is equally true that "new Presbyterian was but old Priest writ large." In the matter of intolerance and ecclesiastical despotism unfortunately Presbyterians must be classed with Episcopalians and Romanists, their only merit being that they learned the true meaning of religious liberty a little sooner than the others. When finally here in America they came to see that toleration is not the "last and strongest hold of Satan," and that the freedom of others is as sacred as their own, then they became and have ever since remained "thoroughly loyal to the cause of liberty and the rights of mankind."

In the uniform set of denominational histories being published by Baker & Taylor the account of the Presbyterian church by Dr. Thompson is confined to this country, but Dr. Vedder in treating of *The Baptists*<sup>35</sup> devotes more than half his pages to their history in England, giving somewhat special heed to their historical antecedents. He has a penchant, not for panegyric, but for truth-telling, and hence the plain facts come out even though theories cherished in certain quarters are upset thereby. When history is being written the partisan and advocate have lost their vocation. If there is no historic proof of an apostolic succession of Baptist churches; if descent from the anabaptists is precluded by the vagaries, errors, and crotchets which were inseparably mixed with anabaptistry; if the history of the Baptists properly so called really begins with the Separatist movement in England near the opening of the seventeenth century; if in the earlier times the school of Arminius claimed as many disciples as the school of Calvin, and extreme Arminianism and high Calvinism split the Baptist host into warring factions and implacable foes; if at first Baptists were not immersionists, practicing affusion until 1641; if at the bar of history "open" communion can show as many marks of age as "close;" if feet-washing, anointing the sick, worshiping without song, and preaching without pay are ancient Baptist customs; if mid-week prayer-meetings, Sunday schools, young people's and missionary societies, colleges and seminaries, and all the modern ecclesiastical machinery constitute no part whatever of

<sup>35</sup>*The Baptists*. ("The Story of the Churches.") By HENRY C. VEDDER, D.D. New York: Baker & Taylor, 1903. 245 pages. \$1, net.

the original Baptist heritage—then it is evident that in their history Baptists have passed through all sorts of changes, and that in present-day contentions over disputed points in polity and doctrine the appeal to precedent and to antiquity is of slightest value. In Dr. Vedder's narrative we mark the vicissitudes and changes through which the denomination has passed, its achievements and progress, its periods of stagnation, of decline, of growth, and, here in America, its hard struggle with Campbellism, Masonry, Millerism, and slavery, and, in more recent times, its onward and upward move in missionary and educational undertakings. A history that gives the facts as they are is of immeasurably more interest and value than a mere laudation, and *The Baptists* is such a history. In marked contrast is an English publication, entitled, *What Baptists Stand For*.<sup>36</sup> It is hard to conjecture why it was written and how it found a publisher. Its nine chapters are on threadbare themes, in the rambling discussion of which neither freshness of thought nor vigor of statement is displayed.

In passing from Methodist, Presbyterian, and Baptist history to the life and times of the Catholic queen, St. Clotilda,<sup>37</sup> we are transported into another world. We witness the scenes and we breathe the spirit of the early Middle Age. Dean Milman in his *Latin Christianity* maintains that in its immediate and remote consequences the conversion of Clovis was the most important event in mediæval history. It meant the founding of the Merovingian dynasty, the overthrow of Arianism, and the establishment of the Catholic faith. This conversion, fraught with such momentous consequences, is to be attributed directly to Queen Clotilda. In writing her life l'abbé Poulin has brought under review the entire history in the midst of which she moved. Interspersed with the biography are extended notices of the Franks and the Romans, the Arians and the Catholics, the peoples whose dominions Clovis subjugated and the sanguinary careers of the sons who succeeded him. The chief source of information is, of course, the *Ecclesiastical History of the Franks*, by Gregory of Tours. The writer has not only reproduced the material thus furnished, but—which is peculiarly interesting and significant—he has himself exhibited the point of view and the very spirit of Gregory. Often the mental and moral temper of the story-teller is more instructive and

<sup>36</sup>*What Baptists Stand For; and Gleanings in the Field of Baptist History.* By REV. ALFRED PHILLIPS. London: Stockwell, 1903. 120 pages. 1s. 6d., net.

<sup>37</sup>*Sainte Clotilde.* Par L'ABBÉ C. POULIN. Paris: Maison de la Bonne Presse. xxx + 375 pages.

entertaining than the story itself. The life of Clotilda has a certain value, but the value of the religious self-revelation of her biographer is even greater. Here is a man in whose mind Christianity and the papal hierarchy are indissolubly bound together, are indeed identical. By her devotion to the Catholic faith and the mother-church God will direct and determine the history and destiny of France. By their failure to recognize this primordial verity the most illustrious French historians have vitiated their work, and the pages of Guizot, Michelet, Martin, and Thierry are filled with contradictions, incoherencies, false colors, and strange errors which a simple country priest, devoutly Catholic, can easily enough point out. God in the papal church and the papal church in France is the light in which the history must be read, the key with which its mysteries must be unlocked, the scales in which its actors and their deeds must be weighed. Barbarians, Romans, Arians, Catholics, Clovis, Clotilda, Remegius, Geneviève and all the rest can be speedily and justly blessed or cursed by noting their attitude toward holy church; and this human judgment God himself confirms by the gift of miracles. He does not hesitate to display his miraculous power on all sorts of occasions and in all sorts of unexpected ways. Miracles abound, and without wincing the good abbot accepts them all. He credulously weaves them into his narrative, however trivial, absurd, puerile, grotesque, or ridiculous. One stops to wonder what kind of a religion and what kind of a God Clovis and Clotilda and the saints of the fifth century created for themselves, and to wonder still more that a man in the twentieth century can yield himself joyously to such superstition and folly. It must not be thought that l'abbé Poulin is alone in this, for his life of Clotilda has the *imprimatur* of the archbishop of Paris and a highly eulogistic *approbation* by the archbishop of Chambéry.

In this JOURNAL, April, 1903, we reviewed Thwaites's life of Marquette. The life of this illustrious Jesuit missionary and explorer by Hedges<sup>38</sup> is in no respect equal to that by Thwaites, except that it gives the full particulars of the discovery of the burial place of Marquette. The author himself declares that his real object is, not to write a full biography, but "to set forth what facts we have on hand concerning the discovery of Marquette's grave, and to prove that the

<sup>38</sup>*Father Marquette. His Place of Burial at St. Ignace, Michigan.* By REV. SAMUEL HEDGES, A.M. New York: Christian Press Association, 1903. 164 pages. \$1, net.

modest marble shaft in Marquette Park, St. Ignace, Michigan, really marks the final resting-place of the great missionary."

ERI B. HULBERT.

FRANKLIN JOHNSON.

JOHN W. MONCRIEF.

CHARLES L. BIGGS.

THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO.

---

### RECENT LITERATURE IN PRACTICAL THEOLOGY.

ONE hundred years have passed since the birth of Horace Bushnell. It is natural that the century mark should have suggested the publication of a new volume<sup>1</sup> from his pen. The book contains an unfinished paper on "Inspiration by the Holy Spirit;" eleven sermons, complete or nearly so; twenty-eight selections from sermons, some of which are long extracts, while others contain only a few paragraphs; and about one hundred pages at the end devoted to "Miscellanies and Bibliography." The volume is not without value, for the freshness and vigor of Bushnell's style and thought are here. But, unless one is intending to buy all his works, it will be wise to select volumes long well known in preference to this. The sermons, for example, while of a high order, do not reach the level of that remarkable collection which ought to be in every preacher's library, *Sermons for the New Life*. Ministers who are seeking for good examples of the discussion of current events from the pulpit will find in this new volume sermons relating to the financial crisis of 1857, to the water supply of the city of Hartford, and to the disaster at Bull Run in 1861, that show how one pulpit did this thing (occasionally) and maintained its high standards.

Admirers of James Martineau will welcome this new volume of sermons and addresses<sup>2</sup> selected from manuscripts left by him at his death. It contains six sermons relating to national duties, sixteen upon more distinctly religious themes, and twenty-three addresses delivered upon various occasions; such as communion, christening, marriage, funerals, theological class graduations, and installations. The charm of his other writings is present—and the lack too. Take, for example, the sermon entitled "Faith in Christ for His Own Sake."

<sup>1</sup> *The Spirit in Man: Sermons and Selections*. By HORACE BUSHNELL. New York: Scribner, 1903. xi + 473 pages. \$1.25, net.

<sup>2</sup> *National Duties, and Other Sermons and Addresses*. By JAMES MARTINEAU. London and New York: Longmans, Green & Co. viii + 461 pages. 6s., net.